

The American University in Cairo

School of Humanities and Social Sciences

**Tolerance in Islamic Architecture**

A Thesis Submitted to

The Department of Arab and Islamic Civilizations

in partial fulfillment of the requirements for  
the degree of Master of Arts/Science

by  
Aya Mohamed el-Hakim

(under the supervision of Dr. Bernard O'kane)

January 2013

**Dedication**

**To**

my father Mohamed el Hakim,  
my mother Nahed el Gohary and  
my husband Moustafa Omar.  
Thanks for your Support and help.

### **Acknowledgment**

I would like to express my gratitude to all my teachers in the department that helped me to reach this stage; Dr. George Scanlon, Dr. Bernard O'kane, Dr. Chahinda Karim and Dr. Hoda el Saadi, who generously shared their wealth of knowledge with me and all their students. I would like to send also my deepest thanks and appreciations to my adviser Dr. Bernard O'kane for his continuous help and patient towards me until the whole work was accomplish.

In addition, I would like to thank also my sister in law Rana Gaber and my cousin Noha Dessouki for their permanent support and generous help.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>List of Figures</b> .....	vi
<b>I. - A Forgotten Imprint - Historical Background</b> .....	1
A. Tolerance before Islam.....	1
B. 1. The People of the Book at the time of the Prophet.....	3
B. 2. The People of the Book at the time of the four rightly-guided caliphs.....	6
C. The People of the Book at the time of the Umayyad, Fatimid, Mamluk, Abbasid and Ottoman periods.....	8
<b>II. The concept of tolerance in Islam - When The Ulema Speak</b> .....	16
A. Muslim laws governing relations with the People of the Book.....	23
1. New Muslim cities built during Islam.....	23
2. Cities built before Islam and taken by force ( <i>'unwa</i> ).....	23
3. Cities built before Islam and taken upon voluntary acquiescence of the city residents ( <i>sulhan</i> ).....	24
B. Application of the law.....	25
<b>III. The Concept of Tolerance in Islamic Architecture</b> .....	27
A. Urban location as an indication of tolerance or Intolerance.....	27
1. Demolishing churches to signify power shifts.....	27
2. Building mosques near churches.....	28
A. To show tolerance between the Muslims and the Christians.....	29
B. Undermining the power of the church.....	29
3. Keeping churches in place while restricting any future extension.....	29
4. Christians accepting the conversion of churches into mosques: a sign of cooperation and friendliness?.....	34
5. Allowing new churches to be built as a sign of tolerance.....	35
6. Restricting the construction of mosques near churches.....	37
<b>IV. Secrets Revealed</b> .....	39

A. Demolishing churches - a common Muslim practice or an extraordinary one?.	39
B. How many verified cases of church demolition?.....	39
C. Was demolition more commonly practiced at a particular time?.....	41
D. Places where Muslims left churches intact.....	43
1. Egypt where churches witnessed tolerance.....	43
A. Cairo.....	43
1. The fortress of Babylon.....	45
2. ‘Amr ibn al-‘As Mosque.....	46
B. Alexandria.....	47
2. The conquest of Jerusalem.....	50
A. The Mosque of ‘Umar.....	52
B. The al-Aqsa Mosque and the Dome of the Rock.....	53
E. Cities where Muslims demolished churches to build mosques.....	57
1. Damascus: The Great Mosque of Damascus.....	57
2. The Great Mosque of Aleppo similarity with the mosque of Damascus.....	64
3. The Great Mosque of Hama.....	65
4. The Zaytuna mosque an influence of Cordoba.....	67
5. Legends, wonders and misery- The Great Mosque of Cordoba.....	69
F. The conquest of Constantinople: fulfilment of a prophecy.....	76
1. Hagia Sophia.....	78
2. Al-Fatih Mosque.....	86
<b>V. Conclusion.....</b>	<b>90</b>
<b>Bibliography .....</b>	<b>96</b>
<b>Appendix 1.....</b>	<b>99</b>
<b>Figures.....</b>	<b>109</b>

## List of Figures

1. A graph showing the ratio between the appearance of the word peace (140 times) in the Quran with its derivatives and the word war (6 times) (from al-Sirganī, *Akhlāq al-hurūb* fig.2).
2. The Dome of the Rock (from <http://www.sacred-destinations.com/israel/jerusalem-dome-of-the-rock>).
3. The dome of the Holy Sepulcher (from [http://hawkebackpacking.com/israel\\_jerusalem\\_holy\\_sepulchre.html](http://hawkebackpacking.com/israel_jerusalem_holy_sepulchre.html)).
4. The Great Mosque of Cordoba, Spain (from [http://archnet.org/library/sites/one-site.jsp?site\\_id=31](http://archnet.org/library/sites/one-site.jsp?site_id=31)).
5. The Great Mosque of Damascus, Syria (from [http://archnet.org/library/sites/one-site.jsp?site\\_id=7161](http://archnet.org/library/sites/one-site.jsp?site_id=7161)).
6. Damascus Walled city (from Lababedi, *Urban Development*, Map 11).
7. The Roman city of Damascus (from Lababedi, *Urban Development*, fig. 3).
8. Historical Development of Damascus indicating that until the Umayyad time the Muslims were located within the walled city (from Lababedi, *Urban Development* Map 4).
9. The fortress of Babylon including the churches and the Synagogue (from Alfred G. Butler, *Fath al-‘arab*, 209).
10. Showing Babylon and its surrounding after the Fustat was built (from Kamāl, *al-Fāth*, 285).
11. Showing the Plan of al-Fustat and in the middle of it the mosque of ‘Amr (from Kamāl, *al-Fāth*, 337).
12. Plan of the Mosque of ‘Amr ibn al-‘As and its development phases (from Abouseif, "Early Islamic Architecture", fig. 11).
13. The plan of Alexandria at the time of the conquest indicating the location of the important churches (from Kamāl, *al-Fāth*, 318).
14. General view from southwest with mosque ‘Umar in the foreground and the minaret of Khanqah Salahiyya in the background (from [http://archnet.org/library/sites/one-site.jsp?site\\_id=5557](http://archnet.org/library/sites/one-site.jsp?site_id=5557)).
- 15-16. The mosque of ‘Umar built without any dome, unlike the Dome of the Rock (from [http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Mosque\\_of\\_Omar\\_\(Jerusalem\)](http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Mosque_of_Omar_(Jerusalem))).

17. The interior of the Dome of the Rock indicating the small space surrounding the dome (from Creswell, *A Short Account*, fig. 2).
18. Interior mosaic in the Dome of the Rock (from <http://www.websters-online-dictionary.com/definition/mosaic>).
19. The church at Qala'at Sim'an whose dome inspired the Muslims while building the Dome of the Rock and al-Aqsa mosque (from Grafman, "The Two Great Syrian Umayyad Mosques", fig. 8)
20. The Greek Temple located within Damascus street map (from Lababedi, *Urban Development*, fig. 2)
21. The Greek Temple of Jupiter indicating its eastern approach and Damascus street map (from Lababedi, *Urban Development*, fig. 1)
22. Plan of the temple of Jupiter (from Dussaud, "Le Temple de Jupiter", fig.3)
23. Plans of the mosque of Damascus according to Dussaud (Dussaud, "Le Temple de Jupiter damascien", Pl. LII).
24. Isometric indicating the location of the Basilica within the temenos at time of conquest (Creswell, *Early Muslim Architecture*, fig. 100)
25. Plan of the mosque of Damascus built by al-Walid (from Creswell, *A Short Account of Early Muslim*, fig.9)
26. Axonometric of the Great Mosque of Damascus (from [http://archnet.org/library/sites/one-site.jsp?site\\_id=7161](http://archnet.org/library/sites/one-site.jsp?site_id=7161))
27. Byzantine Corinthian Columns inside the madrasa of Halawiya (from [http://archnet.org/library/sites/one-site.jsp?site\\_id=2693](http://archnet.org/library/sites/one-site.jsp?site_id=2693))
28. Plan of the Great Mosque of Aleppo (from <http://islamic-arts.org/2012/aleppo-%E2%80%93-architecture-and-history/>)
29. The shrine of Zachariah inside the Great Mosque of Aleppo (from [http://archnet.org/library/sites/one-site.jsp?site\\_id=7501](http://archnet.org/library/sites/one-site.jsp?site_id=7501))
30. The plan of the Great Mosque of Hama (from O'Kane, "The Great Mosque of Hama", fig. 9.2)
31. Courtyard of the mosque of Hama (from [http://archnet.org/library/sites/one-site.jsp?site\\_id=7999](http://archnet.org/library/sites/one-site.jsp?site_id=7999))
32. Riwaq of the mosque of Hama (from [http://archnet.org/library/sites/one-site.jsp?site\\_id=7999](http://archnet.org/library/sites/one-site.jsp?site_id=7999))

33. Treasury of the Great Mosque of Hama (from [http://archnet.org/library/sites/one-site.jsp?site\\_id=7999](http://archnet.org/library/sites/one-site.jsp?site_id=7999))
34. Plan of the Zaytuna mosque showing different construction periods. Blue is ninth century, green is tenth century, pink is thirteenth to sixteenth century, and yellow is nineteenth century (from [http://archnet.org/library/sites/one-site.jsp?site\\_id=14061](http://archnet.org/library/sites/one-site.jsp?site_id=14061)).
35. Outer facade of the Zaytuna mosque (from [http://archnet.org/library/sites/one-site.jsp?site\\_id=14061](http://archnet.org/library/sites/one-site.jsp?site_id=14061))
- 36- 37. Horseshoe arches in the mosque of Zaytuna, similar to Cordoba mosque (from [http://archnet.org/library/sites/one-site.jsp?site\\_id=14061](http://archnet.org/library/sites/one-site.jsp?site_id=14061))
38. Isometric of Cordoba Mosque; 1-bell tower, 2-Patio de Los Naranjos, 3-water source, 4-Christian cathedral, 5-prayer hall, 6-Mihrab area (from <http://www.spanish-fiestas.com/cordoba/mosque/>)
39. Plan of the development and extensions of the Cordoba mosque (from <http://cathedralquest.com/SpainDay11.htm>)
40. Horseshoe arches, Cordoba mosque (from [http://archnet.org/library/sites/one-site.jsp?site\\_id=31](http://archnet.org/library/sites/one-site.jsp?site_id=31))
41. The double tiered arches, Cordoba mosque, an influence of the Great mosque of Damascus (from [http://archnet.org/library/sites/one-site.jsp?site\\_id=31](http://archnet.org/library/sites/one-site.jsp?site_id=31))
- 42-43. Interior of the chapel built inside the mosque of Cordoba (from [http://archnet.org/library/sites/one-site.jsp?site\\_id=31](http://archnet.org/library/sites/one-site.jsp?site_id=31) and <http://cathedralquest.com/SpainDay11.htm>)
44. Plan of Hagia Sophia before the Islamic conquest (from <http://www.studyblue.com/notes/note/n/byzantine-early-middle--late/deck/2856412>)
45. Section of Hagia Sophia (from [http://archnet.org/library/sites/one-site.jsp?site\\_id=2966](http://archnet.org/library/sites/one-site.jsp?site_id=2966))
46. The plan of Hagia Sophia at the time of the Ottomans (from [http://archnet.org/library/sites/one-site.jsp?site\\_id=2966](http://archnet.org/library/sites/one-site.jsp?site_id=2966))
47. Interior of the mosque of Hagia Sophia (from [http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Hagia\\_Sophia](http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Hagia_Sophia))
48. Hypothetical cross-section of the original mosque of Mehmet II (from [http://archnet.org/library/sites/one-site.jsp?site\\_id=2958](http://archnet.org/library/sites/one-site.jsp?site_id=2958))
49. The complex of Beyazid in Istanbul (from [http://archnet.org/library/sites/one-site.jsp?site\\_id=7707](http://archnet.org/library/sites/one-site.jsp?site_id=7707))